

# Anth 500: The Development of the Discipline

## Professor Lisa Messeri

### Fall 2020

Email: [lisa.messeri@yale.edu](mailto:lisa.messeri@yale.edu)

Office Hours: [lisamesseri.youcanbook.com](http://lisamesseri.youcanbook.com); by appointment

Office Location: Zoom / 10 Sachem, rm 308

Welcome to the strange new world of being an anthropologist. You are about to embark on years or decades of having the following conversation:

*Well Meaning Person:* What do you do?

*You:* I'm an anthropologist.

*WMP:* I took an anthro class in college! I loved learning about [insert almost any subject other than sociocultural anthropology].

*You:* [Decide whether to clarify or change the subject]

And it's no wonder there is so much confusion over what anthropology is. As we will learn in this class, there is no one clear answer to this question nor ought there be. We will be reading work by historically significant anthropologists and tracing developments in European and American anthropology. This class, however, does not reify the "great man" approach to history but (1) recognizes the historical importance of such an enduring mythology and (2) places these men (and sometimes women) in context where we can see the influence of non-male, non-white, non-western thought. In our contemporary moment – given the politics of the world and the discipline – how should we think about the history of our field?

#### **Assessment Overview**

These assessments are constructed to help you achieve the goals of this class: (1) Understand classic texts; (2) Critique the texts through writing, discussion, and presentations; (3) Be prepared to use texts in teaching and research in the future.

1. Read and come to class prepared to discuss (1/4 of your course grade). This is your most important task and where the bulk of your work and learning will occur. The classroom will provide an opportunity to work through what you've read, but reading itself will be *work* and thus both challenging and rewarding.
2. Concept Journal (1/4 of your course grade). To get the most out of this course, you must read with purpose. There will be certain things that I want you to read for, but I also want you to decide on a theme that you care about and read for that. My advice is that this theme is not central to your potential dissertation project, but rather a theme that

you think is core to anthropology – one that brought you to the discipline initially. Themes could be race, class, gender, environment, economics, love, emotion, difference, etc. During week 2, bring a few potential theme ideas to class for me to approve/advise on. You will begin the concept journal during Week 3. Each week, you will write a journal entry about how your concept figures (or doesn't) in the week's primary source. If there are multiple primary sources, you can do multiple entries or just one. Your journal entries should be between 200 and 500 words.

3. Lead a close reading (1/4 of your course grade). Twice during the semester, you will choose a passage (a few paragraphs) from the primary text and come to class prepared to lead a conversation that walks the class through this passage. You will begin by reminding the class of the context of the passage (where in the text does it come) and then have a series of questions prepared to lead us through an analysis. I will ask that you set up a meeting with me in advance of class the first time you lead to discuss your approach. On weeks where you present, you do not need to write an entry in your concept journal.
4. Final Presentation (1/4 of your course grade). In lieu of a formal final paper, you will give 15-minute conference-style oral presentation. You can choose to either present on your concept or select two anthropologists we read in class to compare and contrast.

### **Grading Approach**

Half way through the semester, I will provide each student a brief written assessment of your performance so far. I will indicate your current grade (on the GSAS scale of H [honors], HP [high pass], P [pass]), provide feedback on your assignments and class performance so far, and suggest where to improve for the remainder of the semester. During the first few weeks of class, I may provide additional feedback on your concept journals or other activities if I find you need help adjusting to the expectations of the class. If you don't receive much feedback from me (aside from verbally in class, where your work will get plenty of attention), assume you are doing well!

### **How to read for this class**

Each week has two kinds of reading: Primary Sources which will often comprise of the target ethnography for the week and Secondary Sources drawing both from the 500 Archive and other articles to provide historical and critical context. Each kind of source requires a different readerly approach.

#### Primary Sources

Especially in the beginning of the semester, the target ethnographers are long and dense. Often, I will provide guidance on where to focus. I expect you to read beyond this focus,

especially with your concept in mind. While **I don't expect you to read every word on every page**, I want you to develop strategic reading habits such that you feel confident you understand the text and have informed questions. We will discuss reading strategies throughout the first few weeks of class.

### Contextual Sources

Professor Bill Kelly taught this class for more than 15 years. As you'll see from the syllabus, there is a wealth of information about this class that will guide us through many of the week. In the past, each ethnography was given 2 weeks – the first on the primary text and the second incorporating secondary sources. I've collapsed these two weeks in an effort to cover more ground. In the 500 archive texts, you might sometimes encounter vestiges of texts we haven't read. In addition to the reading guides, we'll be reading parts of a document that Prof. Kelly wrote as a text book of sorts companion to this class.

The critical/historical perspectives are more recent texts that will help us put the primary source in context. They will elucidate the biographies of the anthropologists, their institutional contexts, and contemporary concerns. These sources can most often be read for their argument. Again, I don't expect you to read every word, but rather think of yourself as a researcher piecing together a story surrounding the target text.

### Reading Order

Your reading goal is to get the most out of the primary text. I *don't* want you to feel lost and estranged from the text, so experiment with whether you get more out of the text by bringing a clean slate or benefit from reading all or some of the secondary sources in advance. Almost always, you'll want to look at the reading guide first.

### Taking Notes

**Reading is an active practice.** I highly recommend taking notes – either by hand or computer – as you read. This will both help you with the concept journal and generating questions and discussion in class. Take notes on passages that resonate, alarm, or befuddle; record page numbers and bring these to class for discussion. When you finish reading the text, try to write a 2-3 sentence summary on what you think the text is about.

### **Course Material**

Below are the following required texts. I have not ordered them at the book store, as it will be less expensive to buy them used through the online retailer of your choosing. There are also several copies of each at the library. Be kind to your student (and professor!) and do not recall a checked out item. Instead, use Interlibrary Loan. This takes a bit of time, so through whatever method, make sure you have the text in hand at least 2 weeks before we will discuss. One silver lining of COVID-19 is that Yale has subscribed to several digital archives and so most of these texts are also available online through the library. You'll need VPN, but otherwise this should be straightforward. Let me know if you have any access issues.

- Malinowski, Bronislaw (1922). *Argonauts of the Western Pacific*.
- Evans-Pritchard, Edward E. (1940). *The Nuer*.
- Hurston, Zora Neale (1935). *Mules and Men*.
- Mead, Margaret (1935). *Sex and Temperament in Three Primitive Societies*.
- Pandian, Anand (2019). *A Possible Anthropology*.

### **Week 1 (Sept 1) – Course Intro: The indeterminacy of history and why we do it anyway**

- Bashkow, Ira, et al. (2019). "Voicing the Ancestors: Readings for the Present from Anthropology's Past." *American Anthropologist*.
- Bashkow, Ira (2019). "On History for the Present: Revisiting George Stocking's Influential Rejection of 'Presentism.'" *American Anthropologist*.

### **Week 2 (Sept 8) – Evolution, Progress, and Race in Early British and American Anthropology**

#### **Primary Sources**

- Spencer, Herbert (1857). "Progress: Its Law and Cause," Bottom of pg. 8-10, 28-34, 52-58.
- Morgan, Lewis H. (1877). *Primitive Society*, pg. 4-7<sup>1</sup>
- Tylor, Edward B. (1889). "On a Method of Investigating the Development of Institutions," *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 18: 245-269 (a discussion of the paper follows on pages 270-272).
- Boas, Franz (1889). "On Alternating Sounds," *American Anthropologist* 2(1):47-51

#### **Contextual Sources**

From the 500 Archive

- Kelly, Foundations: Evolution, Race, and Society, 28 – 64
- Tylor Reading Guide
- Boas Reading Guide

Critical/Historical Perspectives

- Darnell, Regna (2008). "North American Traditions in Anthropology: The Historiographic Baseline." In *A New History of Anthropology* ed. Henrika Kuklick. 35-51
- Kuklick, Henrika (2008). "The British Tradition." In *A New History of Anthropology* ed. Henrika Kuklick. 52-78

---

<sup>1</sup> This and subsequent highlighted texts can be accessed online via Yale Library (via search or linked from canvas).

## Week 3 (Sept 15) – Boas, North American Anthropology, and Indigenous Knowledge

### Primary Sources

- Boas, Franz (1897). *The Social Organization and the Secret Societies of the Kwakiutl Indians: Based Upon Personal Observations and on Notes Made by Mr. George Hunt.*
  - Focus on Chapters 2, 3, and 10.

### Contextual Sources

From the 500 Archive

- Boas Reading Guide
- Kelly, Boas among the “Kwakiutl” (K'wak'w'ak'a'wak'w) 83-93

Critical/Historical Perspectives

- Chief Robert Joseph (2005) “Introduction: An Elder’s Perspective,” in *Listening to Our Ancestors: The Art of Native Life along the North Pacific Coast*, edited by Robert Joseph for National Museum of the American Indian, pp. 9–13
- Wilner, Isaiah (2013). “A Global Potlatch: Identifying the Indigenous Influence on Western Thought.” *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 37(2): 87-114.
- Bruchac, Marge (2018) “Finding Our Dances: George Hunt and Franz Boas,” in *Savage Kin: Indigenous Informants and American Anthropologists*, pp. 20–47
- WATCH: Aaron Glass (2004). “In Search of the Hamat’sa: A Tale of Headhunting”

## Week 4 (Sept 22) – Boas, Du Bois, and the Racial Imagination

### Primary Sources

- Du Bois, WEB. *The Souls of Black Folk.*
  - Forethought, Chapter 1 “Of Our Spiritual Strivings”, Chapter 8 “Of the Quest of the Golden Fleece” and Chapter 9 “Of the Sons of Master and Man”
- Boas, Franz (1911 [1938 edition]). *The Mind of Primitive Man.*
  - Pg v-vi, 3-18, 35-37, 159, 172-173 [dismisses Spencer], bottom 182-183 [dismisses matrilineal -> patrilineal progression], 197-198, 205-206, 253-255

### Contextual Sources

Critical/Historical Perspectives

- Stocking, George (1966). “Franz Boas and the Culture Concept in Historical Perspective.” *American Anthropologist* 68: 867-882.
- Visweswaran, Kamala (1998). “Race and the Culture of Anthropology.” *American Anthropologist* 100(1): 70-83.
- Harrison (1992). “The Du Boisian Legacy in Anthropology” *Critique of Anthropology* 12(3), 239-260.
- Baker, Lee (1994). “The Location of Franz Boas within the African-American Struggle.” *Critique of Anthropology* 14(2): 199-217.

- Simpson, Audra (2018). “Why White People Love Franz Boas; or, the Grammar of Indigenous Dispossession” in *Indigenous Visions: Rediscovering the World of Franz Boas* ed. Ned Blackhawk and Isaiah Lorado Wilner. Pg. 166-182.
- Appiah, Kwame Anthony (2020). “The Defender of Differences.” *New York Review of Books*.

## Week 5 (Sept 29) – Malinowski and the Method of Fieldwork

### Primary Sources

- Malinowski, Bronislaw (1922). *Argonauts of the Western Pacific*.
  - “Malinowski reading guide” provides guidance for an abridged reading
- Malinowski, Bronislaw (1967). *A Diary in the Strict Sense of the Term*. Selections.

### Contextual Sources

From the 500 Archive

- Malinowski Reading Guide
- Kelly, “Bronislaw Malinowski and ‘The Intensive Study of Limited Areas’” pg. 108-132

Critical/Historical Perspectives

- Stocking, George (1984). “The Ethnographer’s Magic: Fieldwork in British Anthropology from Tylor to Malinowski,” in *Observers Observed*, pp. 70-120
- OPTIONAL WATCH: *Off the Verandah: Bronislaw Malinowski*.

## Week 6 (Oct 6) – Kenyatta, Ortiz, Fei, and Colonial Entanglements

### Primary Sources

- Kenyatta, Jomo (1938). *Facing Mount Kenya: The Tribal Life of the Gikuyu*.
  - Focus on Introduction (Malinowski), Preface, chps 1, 6, Conclusion.
- Ortiz, Fernando (1995 [1947]). *Cuban Counterpoint: Tobacco and Sugar*.
  - Skim Introduction (Coronil), focus up through xvi and xxx to end; read Introduction (Malinowski), Preface + beginning of Chapter 1 (Ortiz)
- Fei Xiaotong (1962 [1939]). *Peasant Life in China*.
  - Acknowledgements (xi), Preface (Malinowski, xiii-xx), Reasons for Selecting the Field (24-26), The Silk Industry (197-235).

### Contextual Sources

Critical/Historical Perspectives

- Matera, Marc (2010). “Black Intellectuals and the Development of Colonial Studies in Britain.” *Journal of British Studies* 49(2): 388-418

## Week 7 (Oct 13) – Evans-Pritchard and the Anthropologist’s Intention

### Primary Sources

- Evans-Pritchard, Edward E. (1940). *The Nuer*

### Contextual Sources

From the 500 Archive

- Evans-Pritchard reading guide
- Kelly, “Evans-Pritchard: Within and Beyond the Structural-Functional Paradigm”, pg. 133-144

Critical/Historical Perspectives

- Johnson, Douglas H. 1982. 'Evans-Pritchard, the Nuer and the Sudan Political Service'. *African Affairs* 81/323:231-246.
- Susan McKinnon 2000 “Domestic Exceptions: Evans-Pritchard and the Creation of Nuer Patrilineality and Equality,” *Cultural Anthropology*, vol. 15, no. 1, pp. 35–83

## Week 8 (Oct 20) – Hurston and Re-thinking Ethnography and the Ethnographer

### Primary Sources

- Hurston, Zora Neale (1934). “Characteristics of Negro Expression.” In *Negro Anthology* ed. Nancy Cunard pg. 39-46.
- Hurston, Zora Neale (1935). *Mules and Men*.
  - Read selectively from Part I: Folk Tales
- Hurston, Zora Neale (1938). “Voodoo and Voodoo Gods” and “Zombies.” In *Tell My Horse*, pg. 376-397; 456-474.

### Contextual Sources

From the 500 Archive

- Kelly, “Beyond Boas,” pg 148-157
- Hurston Reading Guide

Critical/Historical Perspectives

- Boxwell, D.A. (1992). “‘Sis Cat’ as Ethnographer: Self-Presentation and Self-Inscription in Zora Neale Hurston’s *Mules and Men*.” *African American Review* 26(4): 605-617.
- Dunbar, Eve (2018). “Woman on the Verge of a Cultural Breakdown: Zora Neale Hurston in Haiti and the Racial Privilege of Boasian Relativism” in *Indigenous Visions: Rediscovering the World of Franz Boas* ed. Ned Blackhawk and Isaiah Lorado Wilner
- OPTIONAL: Lamothe, Daphne (2008). “Narrative Dissonance: Conflict and Contradiction in Hurston’s Caribbean Ethnography” in *Inventing the New Negro: Narrative, Culture and Ethnography*, pg. 141-159.

## Week 9 (Oct 27) – Margaret Mead, Gender, and Sex on and off the Page

### Primary Sources

- Benedict, Ruth (1934). "The Individual and the Pattern of Culture." In *Patterns of Culture* pg. 251-278.
- Mead, Margaret (2001 [1935]). *Sex and Temperament in Three Primitive Societies*.
  - See "Reading Plan" in reading guide for where to concentrate

### Contextual Sources

From the 500 Archive

- Margaret Mead reading guide
- Kelly, "Margaret Mead: public voice of the discipline", pg. 157-173

Critical/Historical Perspectives

- Sanday, Peggy Reeves (1980). "Margaret Mead's View of Sex Roles in Her Own and Other Societies." *American Anthropologist* 82: 340-348.
- Dobrin, Lise and Ira Bashkow (2010). "'Arapesh Warfare': Reo Fortune's Veiled Critique of Margaret Mead's *Sex and Temperament*." *American Anthropologist* 112(3): 370-383.

Fun read recommendation: Lily King's *Euphoria* – a fictional account of Mead-Fortune-Bateson in PNG

## Week 10 (Nov 3) – WWII and its Aftermaths: Re-encountering Race, Liberalism, and the Limits of Anthropology?

### Primary Sources

- Mead, Margaret (1942). "Are Democracy and Social Sciences Compatible Each with Each?" in *And Keep Your Powder Dry: An Anthropologist Looks at America*. Pg. 176-192.
- Du Bois (1944), "Prospect of a World Without Race Conflict"
- Benedict, Ruth (1946). "Acknowledgements" and "Assignment: Japan," in *The Chrysanthemum and the Sword*. Pg 1-19.
- Lévi-Strauss, Claude (1950). Chp 1-3, 5 in *Race and History*. Pg 5-15, 20-23.
- Montagu, Ashley (1962). "The Concept of Race" *American Anthropologist* 64(5): 919-928.

### Contextual Sources

Critical/Historical Perspectives

- Drake, St. Clair (1978). "Reflections on Anthropology and the Black Experience". *Anthropology and Education Quarterly* 9(2): 85-109.
- Price, David (2019). "Counter-lineages within the History of Anthropology: On Disciplinary Ancestors' Activism," *Anthropology Today*, 35(1): 12–16
- Rouse, Carolyn (2019). "Claude Levi-Strauss' Contribution to the Race Question: Race and History," *American Anthropologist*, 121(3): 721–724.

## **Week 11 (Nov 10) – Critiques and Renewals**

### **Primary Sources**

- Willis Jr., Williams (1972). "Skeletons in the anthropological closet" in *Reinventing Anthropology* ed. Dell Hymes. pg 121-152
- Caulfield, Mina Davis (1972). "Cultural Imperialism: Proposing a New Dialectic" in *Reinventing Anthropology* ed. Dell Hymes 182-212.
- Nader, Laura (1972). "Up the Anthropologist – Perspectives Gained from Studying Up" in *Reinventing Anthropology* ed. Dell Hymes. 284-311.
- Geertz, Clifford (1972). "Deep Play: Notes on the Balinese Cockfight." In *The Interpretation of Cultures*.

### **Contextual Sources**

From the 500 Archive

- Kelly, "Clifford Geertz and Interpretive anthropology", 206-216

## **Week 12 (Nov 17) – Finding Contemporary Possibility in the Discipline's History**

Pandian, Anand (2019). *A Possible Anthropology*

## **Week 13 (Nov 24) – Thanksgiving**

NO CLASS

## **Week 14 (Dec 1) - Presentations**